



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, JUNE 23, 2011  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE ROOMS 1, 2, AND 3  
7447 E. INDIAN SCHOOL RD., STE 105**

**PRESENT:** David Schmidt, Chair  
Len Marcisz, Vice-Chair  
Timothy P. Burns, Commissioner  
Bob Cook, Commissioner  
DeeJaye Lockwood, Commissioner

**ABSENT:** Earl Eisenhower, Commissioner  
Jennifer Smithey, Commissioner

**STAFF:** Don Meserve, Historic Preservation Officer/City Archaeologist  
Debbie Abele, Historic Preservation Consultant

**VISITORS:** Harvey McElhanon, Gary Prior, Steve Hoover, Greg Harmon, Jr.,  
Casey Griffin, Linda Winter, Hyunimo Yoo

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Schmidt called the Historic Preservation Commission meeting to order at 5:31 p.m.

**Roll Call**

A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

**Public Comment**

None.

**1. Discussion/Amendment/Possible Approval:**

• **5/12/11 Regular Meeting Minutes**

The Chair asked staff if they still provide a binder to new Commissioners with training and other materials. Staff replied that new Commissioners get a lot of information on Commission activities including past training materials. Vice-Chair Marcisz volunteered to prepare an Abstract for the recent training and staff accepted his offer to turn the minutes into an Abstract. The Commission expressed their appreciation to Debbie Abele for Grady Gammage, attorney assisting with the May training session.

**MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR MARCISZ, 2<sup>ND</sup> BY COMMISSIONER BURNS TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS DRAFTED. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY, FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).**

**2. Report/Discussion: June 7, 2011 City Council Public Hearing on Villa Monterey Units 1-7**

Mr. Meserve reported that City Council approved the Villa Monterey Units 1-7 HP overlay zoning and historic district designation on their consent agenda on June 7, 2011 by unanimous vote of six (6) to zero (0). Councilwoman Milhaven was absent for the vote on the consent agenda. Two questions were asked of staff before the item stayed on consent and was voted upon. One related to the Friday, June 3, 2011 email from staff recommending a continuance and the second regarding future traffic planning and Chaparral Road.

City Manager David Richert advised Council that there were no longer outstanding transportation issues and that Council could proceed with considering the case. Connie Padian, PNT Administrator advised Council that the city could decide to widen Chaparral Road in the future and that the historic district designation would not restrict the city from making transportation improvements. City Council has the role of balancing neighborhood concerns versus transportation concerns. The Commission had some comments and questions about the city's ability to make road improvements and also asked about past traffic analysis. Dave Meinhart, Transportation Director had traffic counts and other information available to answer any Council questions in the hearing.

Neighborhood representatives were present in numbers but chose not to speak if the item stayed on the consent agenda. Villa Monterey residents, probably fifty plus, left the Council meeting after the vote and celebrated the approval of their historic district outside City Hall.

**3. Report/Discussion/Possible Direction: Discuss 2011 Work Program Designation Priorities**

Ms. Abele noted that this item was placed on the agenda as a follow-up to the Villa Monterey case through a petition process, rather than having to record notarized Prop 207 waivers from all property owners. She suggested rethinking moving forward with other neighborhoods that are not highly organized like Villa Monterey. Any indication of opposition on future districts could cause consideration of the neighborhood to be derailed. A side issue like Chaparral Road could result in a historic district being held back from hearings.

The Commission agreed to discuss progress on their approved 2011 work program at the August 25, 2011 meeting. Ms. Able proposed preparing a strategy plan for moving forward with and/or considering other historic districts. Vice-Chair Marcisz noted that it may not be sufficient to have both a neighborhood that meets the designation criteria in the ordinance and has a majority of support from the homeowners. Mr. Meserve noted that several surveys were completed in past years and a growing number of candidates for designation are now on lists for possible consideration. Scottsdale Estates 4 single family attached neighborhood is not the only resource that has been placed on a list for consideration.

**5. Report/Discussion/Possible Direction: Western Themed Steakhouses in Pinnacle Peak/Reata Pass Area – Commissioner Burns requested this item**

Mr. Meserve suggested that since representatives from the Pinnacle Peak Patio Steakhouse are present, that this item be discussed before the Places of Worship. Commissioner Burns commented that property in the area is currently for sale and would like the steakhouses to be revisited. Mr. Meserve reported on the 2004 tour by the Commission and past discussions about

the characteristics of western themed steakhouses. He attached the list prepared by the Commission of the characteristics. The Commission decided not to pursue any local register designations in 2004 and owner support was not in evidence. Rawhide closed in 2005.

Mr. Meserve informed Southwest Restaurant Systems and heirs of Doc Cavalliere about this item being on the agenda. He spoke to Hoyt Johnson who confirmed that 42 acres was for sale including the Reata Pass Steakhouse and Greasewood Flat. Mr. Johnson told Mr. Meserve the heirs of the trust would not support historic designation. Ms. Abele noted that before the Commission considered an individual property they need to go through the proper steps and analysis, including the writing of a historic context for western themed uses.

Gary Prior acted as spokesperson for Southwest Restaurant Systems and introduced Harvey McElhanon, owner/proprietor for Pinnacle Peak Patio Steakhouse, built in 1957. Mr. Prior advised the Commission that they have plans for refurbishing and remarketing the restaurant as the longest standing steakhouse in Arizona and stated that historic recognition could be great for the long-term future of the steakhouse. He noted that the Capella Group made an offer in 2006 to buy the restaurant and adjacent state land with the intention of demolishing the building and redeveloping the land with a resort use. They did not perform on their offer. The building is roughly 40,000 square feet with several additions over time and some parts possibly historic. Southwest Restaurant Systems plans to talk to the city in the fall about their plans to refurbish the restaurant. They do not want to see the restaurant scrapped and the land redeveloped.

Ms. Abele could prepare an outline to illustrate what such a historic context may include as background on national, state and local trends and themes. Since the population is limited, similar types of uses in the state and Valley could be included in the context which could then be used by the Commission to determine how a specific resource fits into the larger population. The Commission supported the preparation of an outline for a historic context.

#### **4. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Places of Worship Candidates for Designation**

Mr. Meserve described the packet of information provided for the discussion and noted that they are primarily considering these resources in terms of Criterion C., their architectural, artistic, aesthetic and engineering merits, and that they do not consider or discuss the property owners religious beliefs. Ms. Abele noted that historic significance is also a consideration in terms of places of worship representing the growth and maturing of the community and that the buildings can tell the story of community development. She noted that the decision making process for religious bodies can make designations difficult. The review process for the OLP Mission Church was described as a tough process. Ms. Abele noted that the Commission to date has not gotten through the designation of their top five choices for any use category.

Mr. Meserve suggested discussing the architectural/artistic merits of the top candidates the Commission had voted upon previously. Ms. Abele suggested that the religious bodies could be approached with the idea that the city wants to celebrate their architecture in an exhibit or flyer or some other way to get them interested in promoting the architectural significance of their buildings.

**MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR MARCISZ, 2<sup>ND</sup> BY COMMISSIONER COOK TO REQUEST STAFF TO CONTACT THE FOUR TOP PLACES OF WORSHIP TO DETERMINE THEIR WILLINGNESS TO ENTERTAIN HISTORIC PROPERTY DESIGNATION. MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY, FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).**

The four top places of worship based upon the April 2011 Commission vote are: 1) Glass and garden Drive-in Church, 2) Saint Maria Goretti Catholic Church, 3) Los Arcos Methodist Church, and 4) Ascension Lutheran Church. A flyer or exhibit on churches was considered.

#### **6. Report/Discussion: HPO Report on Activities, Projects and Upcoming Events.**

Mr. Meserve encouraged Commissioners to attend the 60<sup>th</sup> Anniversary celebration at the Mayor and Council Breakfast on Saturday morning at the Scottsdale Center for the Performing Arts. Vice-Chair Marcisz also encouraged participation in the Friday evening Cowboy Campfire on the Civic Center Mall. Mr. Meserve noted that he conducted a Mid-Century Modern Architectural Tour as a 60<sup>th</sup> Anniversary event. He distributed information on the tour so Commissioners could take a self-guided tour if desired. In preparing for the tour, Mr. Meserve took photos of branch banks in Scottsdale so he has now completed a reconnaissance survey of local branch banks but no historic context has been prepared for this population.

Mr. Meserve advised the Commission that the agenda item on Taliesin West was removed from the agenda at the request of city staff. He further noted that Taliesin West representatives want to be consulted by staff to select a mutually agreed upon date for the Commission to consider Taliesin West concerns. Some concerns were raised about how the agendas for HPC meetings are prepared. The Commission asked to have an item placed on a future agenda concerning owner notification and procedures for setting agendas. Some comments were made on John Berry's letter complaining to the Mayor, Council and City Manager about not being notified by staff that Taliesin West was on the agenda for discussion. The Commission supports staff inviting the CEO and their attorney to a future meeting.

#### **7. Commissioner Comments and Announcements**

Vice-Chair Marcisz noted that the video on the Pullman car, including a segment interviewing Commissioner Eisenhower, has been a popular city video for people to select. He thanked Commissioner Cook for assisting with the National Trails Day event at the Preserve Gateway.

#### **8. Future Meeting Dates and Agenda Items**

The Commission decided to meet on July 14, 2011. Commissioner Cook will not be available on July 14, 2011. Commissioner Lockwood will not be available for the August 25, 2011 meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 7:29 p.m.

Minutes Prepared by Don Meserve, HPO